Acupuncture in the treatment of obesity: a narrative review of the literature

Maria Belivani, ¹ Charikleia Dimitroula, ¹ Niki Katsiki, ¹ Martha Apostolopoulou, ¹ Mike Cummings, ² Apostolos I Hatzitolios ¹

► Additional data are published online only. To view this file please visit the journal online (http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/acupmed-2012-010247).

¹First Propedeutic Department of Internal Medicine, AHEPA Hospital, Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Thessaloniki, Greece

²British Medical Acupuncture Society, Royal London Hospital for Integrated Medicine, University College London Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust, London, UK

Correspondence to

Professor Apostolos I Hatzitolios, First Propedeutic Department of Internal Medicine, Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, AHEPA Hospital, 1 Stilponos Kyriakidi Street, 54646, Thessaloniki, Greece; axatzito@med.auth.gr

Received 14 September 2012 Revised 16 October 2012 Accepted 22 October 2012 Published Online First 15 November 2012

To cite: Belivani M, Dimitroula C, Katsiki N, *et al. Acupunct Med* 2013;**31**: 88–97.

ABSTRACT

Obesity is one of the leading health risk factors worldwide and is associated with several other risk factors and health problems including type 2 diabetes mellitus, cardiovascular disease and malignancies. Current conventional therapeutic strategies for obesity cannot achieve adequate weight control in all patients, so complementary types of treatment are also performed. Acupuncture, one of the oldest healing practices, represents the most rapidly growing complementary therapy which is recognised by both the National Institutes of Health and the WHO. A previous review concluded that acupuncture was superior to lifestyle advice, to sham acupuncture and to conventional medication. In this narrative review, the possible mechanisms of actions and the results of recent experimental and clinical studies with different forms of acupuncture (eg, body, auricular, manual and electroacupuncture) are presented. In particular, the effects of acupuncture on anorexigenic and orexigenic peptides, insulin resistance, lipid metabolism and inflammatory markers are discussed. Both experimental and clinical current data suggest that acupuncture exerts beneficial effects on the mechanisms of obesity. Some data suggest that electroacupuncture may be more effective than manual acupuncture; however, the most effective frequency remains controversial. Combination of different forms of acupuncture with diet and exercise seems to be necessary for achieving and maintaining weight loss. Further prospective clinical trials are needed to establish the effectiveness of this complementary method for obesity treatment.

INTRODUCTION

The prevalence of obesity is rapidly increasing worldwide, even in developing countries where it coexists with childhood malnutrition. Obesity is one of the

leading health risk factors globally, since 1.1 billion people (>10% of the world population) are classified as overweight. 1-3 Furthermore, obesity is associated with several other risk factors and health problems including insulin resistance, hyperinsulinaemia, type 2 diabetes mellitus, hypertension, dyslipidaemia, coronary heart disease, gallbladder disease and certain malignancies. 4

Current conventional therapeutic strategies for obesity (ie, diet, physical exercise, drugs and bariatric surgery) cannot achieve adequate weight control in all patients. Complementary types of treatment are therefore being tested and, in this context, acupuncture is one of the most rapidly growing complementary therapies. In the USA, the National Institutes of Health consensus panel recommends acupuncture as a useful clinical procedure and thus created the National Center for Complementary and Alternative Medicine with the object of integrating complementary therapies into practice.5 mainstream clinical Acupuncture is among the oldest healing practices in the world.⁵ It exerts its effect through the insertion of thin metallic needles at specific points on the body that can be manipulated manually or by electrical stimulation. The WHO suggests the application of acupuncture to a wide range of conditions including musculoskeletal diseases, neurological disorders, gynaecological disorders, addictions and dentistry.

Contemporary evidence suggests that the neurophysiological effect of acupuncture seems to be exerted by CNS activation which is essential for autonomic nervous system modulation and consequently neuroimmune and hormonal regulation.⁸

Based on these mechanisms, experimental and clinical observations suggest a role for acupuncture in treating metabolic abnormalities as well. Thus, the use of acupuncture has been suggested as a possible alternative treatment method for obesity, which represents a major metabolic disorder. ¹⁰ ¹¹

A previous review found evidence of effectiveness of acupuncture on loss of body weight. In the present review the possible mechanisms of actions and the results of recent experimental and clinical studies with different forms of acupuncture (eg, body, auricular, manual and electroacupuncture (EA)) are presented.

SEARCH METHODS

We searched MEDLINE (up to 1 March 2011) for relevant publications using combinations of the following keywords: acupuncture, EA, auricular acupuncture, obesity treatment, insulin resistance, lipids, leptin, ghrelin, neuropeptide Y (NPY), body weight, inflammatory markers, animal studies and clinical trials. We also examined the reference list of articles identified by this search strategy and selected those we judged relevant, according to our keywords.

Several studies were located that were published in Chinese with English language abstracts. We excluded studies where we could not extract sufficient data from the English abstract since our resources did not include translation from Chinese. Considering the volume of literature, we did not perform formal quality assessment.

POSSIBLE MECHANISMS OF ACTIONS FOR ACUPUNCTURE

According to both animal and clinical studies, several mechanisms involved in body weight regulation and obesity may be influenced by acupuncture. The results of these studies will be further presented in the relevant section.

Anorexigenic and orexigenic peptides

The hypothalamic arcuate nucleus (ARC) responds to satiety and hunger signals, forming the origins of the central neural response to alterations in energy balance. ARC contains at least two populations of neurons that have opposite influences on food intake: one population expresses the anorexigenic peptides α -melanocyte-stimulating hormone (α -MSH), derived from pro-opiomelanocortin, and the cocaine and amphetamine-regulated transcript (CART) peptide, whereas the other population expresses the orexigenic peptides NPY and agouti-related peptide (AgRP). Neurons in the ARC innervate various other hypothalamic targets that express melanocortin and NPY receptors. 10 $^{13-15}$

Furthermore, there are certain hypothalamic nuclei that regulate satiety and hunger such as the hypothalamic ventromedial nucleus (a satiety centre) and the lateral hypothalamus (a hunger centre).¹⁶

Apart from neuropeptides, peripheral peptides are also involved in the regulation of the hypothalamic neurons, and consequently in the control of food intake and energy expenditure, such as leptin and ghrelin. 16 Leptin is a peptide secreted by adipose tissue that effectively reduces hyperphagia and obesity by inhibiting the expression of NPY and by enhancing the expression of α -MSH in the hypothalamus.¹⁴ Obesity is associated with elevated circulating leptin levels, a finding that implies the presence of leptin resistance in obese individuals.¹⁴ Ghrelin is a growth hormone secretagogue, predominantly synthesised in the stomach, that increases AgRP and NPY expression in the hypothalamus and blocks leptin-induced feeding reduction, subsequently leading to increased food intake and body weight. 16

Of note, a part of the cavum conchae is innervated by the auricular branch of the vagal nerve¹⁷ which is stimulated in order to achieve a degree of appetite suppression.¹⁸

Glucose metabolism and insulin resistance

Obesity, mainly the central or visceral type, is a predisposing factor for the development of insulin resistance and type 2 diabetes mellitus. Furthermore, relationships between visceral obesity, increased free fatty acids and insulin resistance have been reported. ¹⁹ Thus, lowering plasma free fatty acid levels may positively affect insulin sensitivity. Of note, progressive reductions in plasma insulin growth factor-1 (IGF-1) levels are involved in obesity-related insulin resistance and increased insulin secretion. ²⁰ Therefore, any intervention that increases IGF-1 levels may lead to improved insulin sensitivity.

In overweight and obese individuals, weight loss and especially decreases in intra-abdominal adipose sensitivity.²¹ tissue may improve insulin Serotonin-induced secretion of β endorphin from the adrenal gland may stimulate the opioid receptor in peripheral muscle to increase peripheral glucose utilisation, resulting in decreased plasma glucose levels.²² Stimulation of cholinergic nerves may also reduce plasma glucose levels²³ and improve resistance.²⁴

Effects on lipid metabolism

Obesity is characterised by atherogenic dyslipidaemia—that is, elevated levels of low-density lipoprotein cholesterol (LDL-C) and triglycerides and decreased levels of high-density lipoprotein cholesterol (HDL-C).²⁵ These lipid disorders significantly increase the cardiovascular risk of obese individuals and should be effectively treated.

Dietary fat-induced β endorphin secretion from the hypothalamus is related to the hedonic preference and ingestion of fat.²⁶ Thus, the induction of β endorphin secretion independently of meals may lead to a

healthier low-fat diet and consequently to an improved lipid profile.

Inflammatory markers

Obesity is associated with low-grade inflammation resulting from chronic activation of the innate immune system, which can subsequently lead to insulin resistance, impaired glucose tolerance and type 2 diabetes mellitus. Furthermore, obese patients have increased levels of several inflammatory markers that are associated with an elevated vascular risk.²⁷ In obesity, white adipose tissue produces inflammatory molecules including tumour necrosis factor α (TNFα) and interleukin 6 (IL-6), both of which can alter insulin sensitivity by triggering different key steps in the insulin signalling pathway.²⁸ In contrast, in obesity the production of adiponectin from the white adipose tissue is downregulated.²⁸ As adiponectin exerts antiinflammatory, antiatherogenic and insulin-sensitising properties,²⁹ obesity-related hypoadiponectinaemia further enhances inflammation, atherosclerosis and insulin resistance in obese individuals.

There are several anti-inflammatory pathways: (1) the humoral pathway targeting macrophages in the inflammatory area, enhancing the production of anti-inflammatory cytokines such as IL-10 and increasing anti-inflammatory hormone levels such as glucocorticoids; (2) the β endorphin pathway; (3) the norepinephrine pathway; and (4) the most recently discovered cholinergic pathway, a neural mechanism that suppresses the innate inflammatory response via the acetylcholine-induced suppression of cytokine synthesis; 30 activating this pathway by nicotine in both genetically obese and diet-induced obese mice significantly improved glucose homeostasis and insulin sensitivity via suppression of adipose tissue inflammation without changes in body weight. 31

ANIMAL STUDIES

Experimental evidence suggests that acupuncture has multifaceted favourable effects on obesity such as weight loss, ^{32–45} regulation of obesity-related peptides, ^{32–50} reduction of insulin resistance ^{35 38 39 40 48 51 52} and improvement of the lipid profile. ^{35 38 39 40 48 51 52} Overall, EA is the method most widely used in experimental studies ^{32 33 35–41 45 48 51–53} as its parameters can be precisely characterised and the results are more or less reproducible. The impact of acupuncture on obesity has been investigated mainly in rats, with the exception of a recent study on mice. ⁵¹

Effects on body weight

The majority of studies located by our search concluded that both acupuncture³⁴ ^{42–44} and EA³² ³⁵ ^{37–41} were effective in reducing body weight in obese rats. Acupuncture influences the levels of neurotransmitters in the CNS and results in significant body weight reduction.³⁴ ^{42–44} With regard to EA, the results

concerning the ideal frequency of stimulation are conflicting: one study found that 100 Hz EA had a greater effect on obesity than 30 Hz EA⁴⁰ while another study concluded that 2 Hz EA was more effective than 100 Hz EA.³² These major discrepancies could be attributed to the different study design, selected acupuncture points and duration of the two studies. In addition, three studies reported weight reduction after EA in rats that were not initially obese. 33 36 45 In one study 2 Hz EA administered once every other day in lean rats subjected to long-term food restriction produced additional reduction in body weight, 33 in a second study 100 Hz EA applied to ad libitum fed normal rats decreased food intake and body weight,³⁶ and in a third study 100 Hz EA resulted in weight loss (-3.3%) and suppression of abstinence syndrome in rats rendered dependent on morphine while 2 Hz EA did not.⁴⁵

On the other hand, body weight did not change in a rat polycystic ovary syndrome (PCOS) model characterised by insulin resistance and adiposity following 2 Hz EA for 4–5 weeks. 48 52 Similarly, abdominal EA did not induce weight loss in *Psammomys obesus*, a model of insulin resistance and non-insulin-dependent diabetes mellitus, 53 but these results could be attributed to the short duration of the intervention (5 days). Finally, in a recent study, 3 Hz EA administered for 8 consecutive weeks in obese diabetic mice did not reduce body weight, although body mass gain and food intake decreased in the EA group. 51 Therefore, acupuncture may be less effective in lowering body weight in experimental models that combine obesity and insulin resistance.

Effects on obesity-related peptides

The favourable effects of acupuncture on body weight in obese rats are attributed to its positive regulatory action on neurotransmitters in the CNS and especially in the hypothalamus. It is generally accepted that acupuncture acts on the satiety centre situated in the hypothalamic ventromedial nucleus34 43 46 47 and increases its electrical activity. Acupuncture also seems to influence the feeding centre in the lateral hypothalamic area, ³⁴ ⁴⁴ ⁴⁷ but its effects there are less clear. In particular, auricular acupuncture was reported to either suppress⁴⁷ or not affect the neuronal activity of the lateral hypothalamus³⁴ whereas another study concluded that acupuncture increased the activity of the lateral hypothalamic area.⁴⁴ These discrepancies may be partly explained by differences in the selected acupuncture points, the techniques used to record the central nervous activity or the duration of the intervention. Finally, it is suggested that a regulatory action on serotonin and its metabolism in the raphe nuclei is one of the possible mechanisms for weight reduction by acupuncture.⁴²

Experimental data suggest that EA can upregulate the expression of obesity-related peptides in the hypothalamus, decrease food intake and induce weight loss. 32 33 37 41 When EA was administered three times per week for 4 weeks in obese rats, increased expression of the anorexigenic peptides α-MSH⁴¹ and CART peptide³² was observed in the hypothalamic ARC. Furthermore, 2 Hz EA applied to lean rats subjected to long-term food restriction resulted in downregulation of the orexigenic peptides NPY (in ARC) and ghrelin (in the stomach).³³ Another study reported that, after treatment with EA for 15 consecutive days, the expression of obestatin (an anorexigenic peptide) was increased in the hypothalamus of obese rats.³⁷ Finally, a recent study concluded that 2 Hz EA treatment acted through ARC to significantly inhibit food intake and body weight gain in rats fed a high-fat diet and that the stimulation of α-MSH expression and release might be involved in the mechanism.⁴⁹

With regard to leptin, 100 Hz EA applied to nonobese rats for 4 weeks produced a significant increase in leptin levels.³⁶ In contrast, EA was shown to reduce leptin levels, in parallel with its weight loss effect, in experimental models of obesity. 35 38 40 Furthermore, when EA or sibutramine were administered using a rat obesity model, serum leptin levels decreased more in the EA group than in the sibutramine group.³⁵ Since obesity is characterised by hyperleptinaemia and leptin resistance, the EA-induced reduction of circulating leptin levels in obese rats may exert a beneficial effect on leptin regulation. Of note, low frequency EA applied to PCOS rats for 4-5 weeks restored leptin expression in visceral adipose tissue without affecting serum leptin levels. 48 In a recent study, EA treatment led to a decrease in the plasma leptin levels and an increase in leptin receptor expression in the hypothalamus in diet-induced obese rats.⁵⁰

Effects on glucose metabolism and insulin resistance

Apart from leptin, insulin levels may also be affected by EA in obese rats and mice. ³⁵ ³⁸ ³⁸ ⁴⁰ ⁴⁸ ⁵¹ ⁵³ Insulin sensitivity, as determined by euglycaemic hyperinsulinaemic clamp, was normalised in PCOS rats after 2 Hz EA stimulation for 5 weeks. ⁴⁸ ⁵² Four other studies reported decreased serum insulin levels after EA treatment in obese rats. ³⁵ ³⁸ ⁴⁰ Furthermore, 3 Hz EA for eight consecutive weeks in diabetic and obese mice resulted in a beneficial effect on insulin resistance established through the intraperitoneal insulin tolerance test. ⁵¹ EA was shown to increase IGF-1 concentrations ⁴⁸ and influence intracellular signalling pathways in the muscle ⁵² that may, at least in part, account for the marked improvement of insulin sensitivity in these studies.

In contrast, abdominal EA in diabetic and obese rats, although inducing a sustained hypoglycaemic effect, did not influence insulin levels compared with EA in non-specific points.⁵³

Moreover, in experimental models of diabetic rats, EA was shown to regulate blood glucose levels by increasing insulin sensitivity, 54 55 inducing secretion of β endorphin 56 57 or stimulating cholinergic nerves. 23 24 Regarding insulin resistance, EA has been reported to improve insulin sensitivity via several mechanisms (eg, lowering plasma free fatty acid levels, 24 58 increasing plasma IGF-1 levels or stimulation of glucose transport in skeletal muscle independently of insulin). 59 60

Effects on lipid metabolism

Another important impact of EA is the improvement of lipid parameters. At 38-40 52 When EA and diet were applied in obese rats for 15 days, total cholesterol and free fatty acid levels decreased significantly. Furthermore, EA was more effective than sibutramine in reducing total cholesterol, triglycerides and LDL-C concentrations. Interestingly, high-frequency EA was reported to restore abnormal lipid metabolism was reported to restore abnormal lipid metabolism more effectively than low-frequency EA. Low-frequency EA was shown to lower LDL-C and HDL-C in PCOS rats, whereas it had no significant effect on total cholesterol and triglycerides in obese diabetic mice. Of note, in hypercholesterolaemic mice, EA was reported to reduce cholesterol levels and regulate the expression of various genes directly involved in cholesterol metabolism. At 161-63

Effects on inflammatory markers

EA was shown to restore the expression of adipose tissue genes such as leptin, IL-6 and uncoupling protein-2 which are associated with insulin resistance, obesity and inflammation in rats with PCOS. ⁴⁸ EA plus diet adjustment can also decrease the levels of serum $TNF\alpha$. ³⁹

CLINICAL STUDIES

The usefulness of acupuncture in treating obese patients has been studied over recent decades. A meta-analysis of 29 randomised controlled trials with different types of acupuncture by Cho *et al*¹¹ found that acupuncture was associated with significant body weight reductions compared with lifestyle measures, placebo or sham treatments and conventional medication (average weight reduction with acupuncture 1.72 kg (CI 0.50 to 2.93) vs lifestyle measures; 1.56 kg (CI 0.74 to 2.38) vs placebo or sham treatments and 1.90 kg (CI 1.66 to 2.13) vs conventional medication, respectively). Nevertheless, this meta-analysis included Chinese studies and a quality assessment conducted within the study found that the quality was poor in two-thirds of studies.

A systematic review of the use of Chinese medicine and acupuncture for the treatment of obesity was published recently and included 44 trials on acupuncture treatment.⁶⁴ The reviewers concluded that acupuncture was more effective than placebo or lifestyle

Table 1 Clinical studies of manual acupuncture for obesity

Study	n	Experimental and control groups	Measured variables	Results
Sun and Xu ⁶⁶	161	Acupuncture Herbal supplement (active controls)	 ▶ BW ▶ Circumference of chest, abdomen, arms and legs ▶ Appetite ▶ Sleep ▶ Bowel movement ▶ TC, TG and HDL-C 	Acupuncture group significantly better for BW reduction (p<0.001) but also decreased appetite, TC and TG
Mazzoni <i>et al⁶⁷</i>	40	Acupuncture (n=20; 12 dropped out) Sham acupuncture (minimal acupuncture and somatic moxibustion) (n=20; six dropped out)	 ▶ BMI ▶ Eating attitudes (BES) ▶ Anxiety (STAI) ▶ Depression (BDI) ▶ Obesity-related quality of life (ORWELL 97) 	Non-significant difference in BMI and obesity-related quality of life. Acupuncture group: improvement in anxiety and depression
Wang ⁶⁸	120	Acupuncture Diet tea+diet	► BMI	BMI reduced significantly in the acupuncture group (p<0.05) compared with the diet group
Wozniak <i>et al</i> ⁶⁹	69	Acupuncture+low calorie slimming diet (n=36) Low calorie slimming diet (n=33)	► Mean BW ► BMI	Significant differences in both parameters (p<0.01) in favour of the combination group $\frac{1}{2}$
Nourshahi et al ⁷⁰	27	Diet+exercise+acupuncture Diet+exercise Control	► BW► Skin fold thickness► BMI► Fat mass	Significant decrease (p<0.05) in BMI and fat mass in both intervention groups compared with control group No significant differences between intervention groups regarding lean body mass
Yang et al ⁷¹	61	Acupuncture, n=31 Control (diet adjustment+aerobic exercise), n=30	► BW ► WHR	Significantly lower BW (p<0.05) in favour of the acupuncture group Non-significant difference in WHR between the two groups
Gucel et al ⁷²	40	Body acupuncture (n=20) Sham (n=20)	 ▶ BW ▶ Insulin ▶ Leptin ▶ Ghrelin ▶ Cholecystokinin 	Significantly lower BW, BMI and cholecystokinin (p<0.001) in favour of the acupuncture group. Significantly lower insulin and leptin (p<0.05) in favour of the acupuncture group. Significantly higher ghrelin (p<0.001) in favour of the acupuncture group

BDI, Beck Depression Inventory; BES, Binge Eating Scale; BW, body weight; BMI, body mass index; BE, β endorphin; EA, electroacupuncture; HOMA-IR, homeostasis model assessment-insulin resistance; HDL-C, high density lipoprotein cholesterol; Ig, immunoglobulin; LDL-C, low-density lipoprotein cholesterol; ORWELL 97, Obesity Related Well-being Questionnaire; STAI, State-Trait Anxiety Inventory; TNF α , tumour necrosis factor α ; TC, total cholesterol; TG, triglycerides; WC, waist circumference; WHR, waist—hip ratio.

modification in reducing body weight, and was as efficacious as conventional anti-obesity drugs but with fewer reported adverse effects. However, the low quality of many of the trials puts these conclusions into question.⁶⁵ The studies included in the present review are summarised in tables 1 (manual), 2 (auricular) and 3 (EA), while studies that were excluded are summarised in table 4 (online only).

Table 2 Clinical studies of auricular acupuncture for obesity

Study	n	Experimental and control groups	Measured variables	Results
Shirashi <i>et al</i> ⁷³	1081	Auricular acupuncture in mildly obese (n=5) Auricular acupuncture in non-obese healthy (n=55) Sham acupuncture (n=520) Control (n=501)	► BW ► Body fat	BW and fat significant reduction in mildly obese after acupuncture treatment (p<0.001) No difference in sham and control groups after treatment
Hsu <i>et al</i> ⁷⁴	45	Auricular acupuncture (n=23)Sham auricular acupuncture (n=22)	▶ BW▶ BMI▶ WC▶ Ghrelin▶ Leptin	No significant differences in percentage reduction in BW, BMI and WC between groups After treatment, group A revealed a significant increase in ghrelin level (p<0.05) and decrease in leptin level (p<0.001), whereas group B showed no significant changes in these levels
Shen <i>et al</i> ⁷⁵	14	A: auricular acupuncture for 4 weeks, then sham auricular acupuncture B: sham auricular acupuncture for 4 weeks, then auricular acupuncture	▶ BW▶ Sympathomimetic effects	Decreased BW and sympathomimetic effects were observed in both groups in the first 4 weeks of stimulation, with no difference between groups The sympathomimetic effects and BW reduction were sustained in group A in the second 4 weeks of stimulation; such effects were not observed in group B

BMI, body mass index; BW, body weight; WC, waist circumference.

Table 3 Clinical studies of EA for obesity

Study	n	Experimental and control groups	Measured variables	Results
Richards and Marley ¹⁸	60	Acupuncture: EA to acupuncture ear points Sham: EA to thumb	➤ Suppression of appetite ➤ Weight loss	Significantly higher weight loss and mean weight loss in favour of acupuncture group (p<0.05) Suppression of appetite in 95% of acupuncture group whereas no suppression in sham group
Cabioğlu and Ergene ⁷⁶	55	EA (n=22) Sham EA (n=12) Diet restriction (n=21)	► BW ► TC ► TG ► HDL-C ► LDL-C	Weight reduction in patients with EA application significantly higher compared with diet and sham groups (p<0.05) Significant decreases in total cholesterol, LDL-C and triglyceride levels in favour of EA compared with sham EA (p<0.05) Non-significant changes in HDL-C levels in the three groups
Hsu <i>et al</i> ⁷⁷	54	A: EA first B: Sit-up exercise first	► BW ► BMI ► WC	At end of trial, no significant differences between groups in all measurements Both groups had significant reductions in BW (p=0.004; 0.001), BMI (p=0.003; 0.021) and WC (p≤0.001; 0.001) compared with baseline values
Hsu <i>et al</i> ⁷⁸	63	A: EA (n=22) B: Sit-up exercises (n=20) C: Control (n=21)	► BW ► BMI ► WC	Significantly greater percentage reductions in BW (p=0.009, 0.004), BMI (p=0.008, 0.016) and WC (p=0.013, 0.006) in EA compared with sit-up exercises or control
Cabioğlu and Ergene ⁷⁹	40	EA (n=20) Diet programme (n=20)	► Leptin ► BE ► Weight loss	Significant decreases in BW in favour of EA group (p<0.0001) Decreases in serum leptin levels (p<0.0001) and increases in serum BE (p<0.05) in favour of EA group
Cabioğlu and Ergene ⁸⁰	52	EA (n=20) Sham EA (n=12) Diet restriction (n=20)	▶ Weight loss▶ Serum insulin▶ C-peptide levels▶ Glucose levels	Significant increases in serum insulin and C-peptide and decreases in BW in favour of EA (p<0.001) Significant decreases in plasma glucose in both EA and diet restriction group compared with sham EA (p<0.01)
Cabioglu et al ⁸¹	165	EA Sham EA Diet restriction	 Weight reduction Phobia, anger, anxiety, obsession, paranoid symptoms and depression 	Weight reduction in EA group significantly greater than in other groups (p<0.001) Significant decreases in phobia, anger, anxiety, obsession, paranoid symptoms and depression in EA group compared with sham EA and diet groups
Cabioglu et al ⁸²	63	EA (n=24) Sham EA (n=13) Diet restriction (n=23)	 BW IgG IgA IgB IgE 	Non-significant changes in serum IgA, IgM and IgE levels in the three groups Significant weight reduction in favour of EA group (p<0.0001) Modulations in serum IgG (p<0.001) in EA compared with the other two groups
Luo and Li ⁸³	60	Manual acupuncture (n=20) EA (n=20) Control (n=20)	➤ Serum leptin ➤ Adiponectin	Significant decreases in leptin and increases in adiponectin in EA compared with other two groups (p<0.05) Decreases in leptin (p<0.005) and increases in adiponectin (p<0.01) in manual acupuncture group
Cabioglu et al ⁸⁴	58	EA (n=20) Sham EA (n=15) Diet restriction (n=23)	 ▶ Weight reduction ▶ Lipoprotein A ▶ Apolipoprotein A ▶ Apolipoprotein B 	Significant weight reduction in both EA (p<0.001) and diet restriction groups (p<0.001) Weight reduction in EA group was more significant (p<0.001) than in sham EA and diet restriction groupsLipoprotein A and apolipoprotein B significantly decreased (p<0.05) only in EA group No effect on apolipoprotein A
Abdi <i>et al</i> ⁸⁵	161	EA and manual acupuncture (n=79) Manual acupuncture at non-acupuncture points (n=82)	BWHCWCLipidshs-CRP	BW, HC, WC and LDL reduced significantly in EA group (p<0.05) compared with other group hs-CRP did not significantly change between the two groups

BW, body weight; BMI, body mass index; BE, β endorphin; EA, electroacupuncture; HDL-C, high density lipoprotein cholesterol; HC, hip circumference; hs-CRP, high-sensitivity C-reactive protein; Ig, immunoglobulin; LDL-C, low-density lipoprotein cholesterol; TC, total cholesterol; TG, triglycerides; WC, waist circumference.

Effect of different types of acupuncture on body weight alone

Body manual acupuncture seems to be more effective in reducing body weight than sham,⁷² herbal supplement,⁶⁶ diet alone⁶⁹ or diet and exercise⁷¹ in some studies, while others⁶⁷ found no effect.

The evidence on auricular acupuncture is also mixed, with positive⁷⁵ ⁷³ and negative⁷⁴ results when compared with sham acupuncture. For EA the evidence is more positive; the majority of studies suggest that EA induces significantly greater weight loss than sham EA, ¹⁸ ^{72–74} ⁷⁶ ^{80–82} ⁸⁴ diet, ⁷⁶ ⁷⁹ ^{80–82} ⁸⁴

exercise⁷⁸ or acupuncture performed at no acupuncture points⁸⁵ whereas only one study concluded that EA and exercise resulted in similar reductions in body weight.⁷⁷

Effects on obesity-related peptides

As already mentioned, obesity is characterised by hyperleptinaemia and leptin resistance. Both manual 72 83 and auricular acupuncture 74 as well as EA⁷⁹ 83 exert a beneficial effect on leptin resistance and cause a significant decrease in plasma leptin levels in obese patients compared with sham⁷² ⁷⁴ or diet alone. ⁷⁹ In addition, manual ⁷² and auricular ⁷⁴ acupuncture significantly increase ghrelin levels in comparison with sham, while EA seems to cause a remarkable increase in β endorphin⁷⁹ and adiponectin⁸³ in parallel to weight loss.

Effects on glucose metabolism and insulin resistance

Studies of the effect of acupuncture on insulin levels have mixed results, showing an increase⁸⁰ decrease⁷² after treatment. In one study, 80 EA decreased serum glucose levels through the increase of serum insulin and C-peptide levels compared with sham EA or diet restriction. On the other hand, a recent study showed that manual acupuncture decreased insulin levels⁷² in obese women compared with sham, and the authors suggest that acupuncture improves insulin sensitivity and normalises insulin levels. Additional research is needed to further explain the therapeutic effects of acupuncture on glucose metabolism and insulin sensitivity.

Effects on lipid metabolism Both manual $^{66\ 85}$ and $\rm EA^{76\ 84\ 85}$ are reported to have a beneficial effect on lipid metabolism in addition to weight loss. Significant decreases in total cholesterol, 66 76 LDL-C^{76 85} and triglycerides 66 76 were observed whereas HDL-C did not change significantly.⁷⁶ In another study⁸⁴ there were significant decreases in lipoprotein A and apolipoprotein B and no changes in apolipoprotein A levels.

Effects on inflammatory markers

In obese women, EA was reported to produce modulations of serum IgG associated with a significant weight loss compared with sham EA and diet restriction⁸² while IgA, IgM and IgE did not change. Similarly, high-sensitive C-reactive protein did not differ among obese subjects treated with manual acupuncture and EA and those who received acupuncture at no acupuncture points.85

Effects on psychological outcomes

Acupuncture also seems to improve the psychological status of obese patients; anxiety (measured by State-Trait Anxiety Inventory) and depression (measured by Beck Depression Inventory) improved after

12 weeks of acupuncture although body weight did not change.⁶⁷ In another trial, significant decreases in phobia, anger, anxiety, obsession, paranoid symptoms and depression were observed in the EA group compared with the sham and diet groups.⁸¹

CONCLUSIONS

Both experimental and current clinical data suggest that acupuncture (in different forms) exerts beneficial effects on obesity. Apart from a reduction in body weight, body mass index, waist and hip circumference, acupuncture seems to affect many biochemical markers of obesity such as insulin resistance, glucose and lipid metabolism, obesity-related peptides (eg, leptin, ghrelin) and inflammatory markers. However, further prospective clinical trials are needed to establish the effectiveness of this complementary method for obesity treatment. Some data suggest that EA may be more effective than manual acupuncture; however, the most effective EA frequency remains controversial. Combinations of different forms of acupuncture with diet and exercise seem to be necessary to achieve and maintain weight loss.

Contributors All authors were involved in literature searching, writing and editing the final manuscript.

Funding None.

Competing interests None.

Provenance and peer review Not commissioned; externally peer reviewed.

REFERENCES

- 1 Monteiro CA, Moura EC, Conde WL, et al. Socioeconomic status and obesity in adult populations of developing countries: a review. Bull World Health Organ 2004;82:1181-6.
- Haslam D, James WP. Obesity. Lancet 2005;366:1197-209.
- Yach D, Hawkes C, Gould CL, et al. The global burden of chronic diseases: overcoming impediments to prevention and control. JAMA 2004;291:2616-22.
- Pi-Sunyer FX. The obesity epidemic: pathophysiology and consequences of obesity. Obes Res 2002;10:97S-104S.
- Ulett JA, Han JA, Han SH. NIH Consensus Development Panel. Acupunct JAMA 1998;280:1518-24.
- National Center for Complementary and Alternative Medicine. NCCAM Funding: Appropriations History. http://nccam.nih. gov/research/extramural/awards/2006/ (accessed 9 Feb 2011).
- World Health Organization. Medicines publications and documentation. http://apps.who.int/medicinedocs/en/ (accessed 20 Jun 2011).
- Cho ZH, Hwang SC, Wong EK, et al. Neural substrates, experimental evidences and functional hypothesis of acupuncture mechanisms. Acta Neurol Scand 2006;113:370-7.
- Andersson S, Lundeberg T. Acupuncture—from empiricism to science: Functional background to acupuncture effects in pain and disease pain and disease. Med Hypotheses 1995;45:271-81.
- Wang F, Tian DR, Han JS. Electroacupuncture in the treatment of obesity. Neurochem Res 2008;33:2023-7.

- 11 Cho SH, Lee JS, Thabane L, *et al.* Acupuncture for obesity: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Int J Obes (Lond)* 2009;33:183–96.
- 12 Van den Top M, Lee K, Whyment AD, et al. Orexigen-sensitive NPY/AgRP pacemaker neurons in the hypothalamic arcuate nucleus. Nat Neurosci 2004;7:493–4.
- 13 Baltatzi M, Hatzitolios A, Tziomalos K, et al. Neuropeptide Y and alpha-melanocyte-stimulating hormone: interaction in obesity and possible role in the development of hypertension. Int J Clin Pract 2008;62:1432–40.
- 14 Cowley MA, Smart JL, Rubinstein M, et al. Leptin activates anorexigenic POMC neurons through a neural network in the arcuate nucleus. Nature 2001;411:480–4.
- 15 Alon T, Zhou L, Perez CA, et al. Transgenic mice expressing green fluorescent protein under the control of the corticotropin-releasing hormone promoter endocrinology. J Neurosci 2010;30:2472.
- 16 Konturek PC, Konturek JW, Cześnikiewicz-Guzik M, et al. Neuro-hormonal control of food intake: basic mechanisms and clinical implications. J Physiol Pharmacol 2005;56(Suppl 6):5–25.
- 17 Peuker ET, Filler TJ. The nerve supply of the human auricle. *Clin Anat* 2002;15:35–7.
- 18 Richards D, Marley J. Stimulation of auricular acupuncture points in weight loss. Aust Fam Phys 1998;27(Suppl 2):S73–7.
- 19 Scaglione R, Di Chiara T, Cariello T, et al. Visceral obesity and metabolic syndrome: two faces of the same medal? *Intern* Emerg Med 2010;5:111–19.
- 20 Succurro E, Andreozzi F, Marini MA, et al. Low plasma insulin-like growth factor-1 levels are associated with reduced insulin sensitivity and increased insulin secretion in nondiabetic subjects. Nutr Metab Cardiovasc Dis 2009;19:713–19.
- 21 Sowers JR. Obesity as a cardiovascular risk factor. Am J Med 2003;115(Suppl 8A):37S–41.
- 22 Chi TC, Ho YJ, Chen WP, et al. Serotonin enhances beta-endorphin secretion to lower plasma glucose in streptozotocin-induced diabetic rats. Life Sci 2007;80:1832–8.
- 23 Lee YC, Li TM, Tzeng CY, et al. Electroacupuncture at the Zusanli (ST-36) acupoint induces a hypoglycemic effect by stimulating the cholinergic nerve in a rat model of streptozotocine-induced insulin-dependent diabetes mellitus. Evid Based Complement Alternat Med 2011;2011:650263.
- 24 Lin RT, Chen CY, Tzeng CY, et al. Electroacupuncture improves glucose tolerance through cholinergic nerve and nitric oxide synthase effects in rats. Neurosci Lett 2011;494:114–18.
- 25 Ginsberg HN, Maccallum PR. The obesity, metabolic syndrome, and type 2 diabetes mellitus pandemic: II. Therapeutic management of atherogenic dyslipidemia. *J Clin Hypertens (Greenwich)* 2009;11:520–7.
- 26 Mizushige T, Saitoh K, Manabe Y, et al. Preference for dietary fat induced by release of beta-endorphin in rats. Life Sci 2009;84:760–5.
- 27 Tziomalos K, Dimitroula HV, Katsiki N, et al. Effects of lifestyle measures, antiobesity agents, and bariatric surgery on serological markers of inflammation in obese patients. Mediators Inflamm 2010;2010:364957.
- 28 Bastard JP, Maachi M, Lagathu C, et al. Recent advances in the relationship between obesity, inflammation, and insulin resistance. Eur Cytokine Netw 2006;17:4–12.
- 29 Chandran M, Phillips SA, Ciaraldi T, et al. Adiponectin: more than just another fat cell hormone? *Diabetes Care* 2003;26:2442–50.

- 30 Oke SL, Tracey KJ. The inflammatory reflex and the role of complementary and alternative medical therapies. *Ann N Y Acad Sci* 2009;1172:172–80.
- 31 Wang X, Yang Z, Xue B, *et al.* Activation of the cholinergic anti-inflammatory pathway ameliorates obesity-induced inflammation and insulin resistance. *Endocrinology* 2011;152:836–46.
- 32 Tian DR, Li XD, Wang F, et al. Up-regulation of the expression of cocaine and amphetamine-regulated transcript peptide by electroacupuncture in the arcuate nucleus of diet-induced obese rats. Neurosci Lett 2005;383:17–21.
- 33 Tian N, Wang F, Tian DR, et al. Electroacupuncture suppresses expression of gastric ghrelin and hypothalamic NPY in chronic food restricted rats. Peptides 2006;27:2313–20.
- 34 Asamoto S, Takeshige C. Activation of the satiety center by auricular acupuncture point stimulation. *Brain Res Bull* 1992;29:157–64.
- 35 Wang SJ, Li Q, She YF, *et al*. Effect of electroacupuncture on metabolism of lipids in rats of obesity induced by sodium glutamate. *Zhongguo Zhen Jiu* 2005;25:269–71.
- 36 Kim SK, Lee G, Shin M, *et al*. The association of serum leptin with the reduction of food intake and body weight during electroacupuncture in rats. *Pharmacol Biochem Behav* 2006;83:145–9.
- 37 Kong XJ, Gao L, Peng H, et al. Effects of electro-acupuncture on expression of obestatin in hypothalamus of rats with simple obesity. Zhong Xi Yi Jie He Xue Bao 2010;8:480–5.
- 38 Wang SJ, Xu HZ, Xiao HL. Effect of high-frequency electroacupuncture on lipid metabolism in obesity rats. Zhen Ci Yan Jiu 2008;33:154–8.
- 39 Yang H, Li Y, Cheng L, et al. Effect of electroacupuncture and diet adjusting on insulin resistance in rats with nutrition obesity. Zhong Xi Yi Jie He Xue Bao 2007;5:546–9.
- 40 Ge JJ, Wang SJ, Sun LH, et al. Effects of electroacupuncture of different frequencies on slimming effect in the rat of experimental obesity. Zhongguo Zhen Jiu 2007;27:598–600.
- 41 Tian D, Li X, Niu D, et al. Electroacupuncture up-regulated arcuate nucleus alpha-MSH expression in the rat of diet-induced obesity. Beijing Da Xue Xue Bao 2003;35:458–61.
- 42 Wei Q, Liu Z. Effects of acupuncture on monoamine neurotransmitters in raphe nuclei in obese rats. *J Tradit Chin Med* 2003;23:147–50.
- 43 Liu Z, Sun F, Su J, *et al*. Study on action of acupuncture on ventromedial nucleus of hypothalamus in obese rats. *J Tradit Chin Med* 2001;21:220–4.
- 44 Liu Z, Sun F, Han Y. Effect of acupuncture on level of monoamines and activity of adenosine triphosphatase in lateral hypothalamic area of obese rats. *Zhongguo Zhong Xi Yi Jie He* Za Zhi 2000;20:521–3.
- 45 Han JS, Zhang RL. Suppression of morphine abstinence syndrome by body electroacupuncture of different frequencies in rats. *Drug Alcohol Depend* 1993;31:169–75.
- 46 Zhao M, Liu Z, Su J. The time-effect relationship of central action in acupuncture treatment for weight reduction. J Tradit Chin Med 2000;20:26–9.
- 47 Shiraishi T, Onoe M, Kojima T, et al. Effects of auricular stimulation on feeding-related hypothalamic neuronal activity in normal and obese rats. Brain Res Bull 1995;36:141–8.
- 48 Mannerås L, Jonsdottir IH, Holmäng A, et al. Low-frequency electro-acupuncture and physical exercise improve metabolic disturbances and modulate gene expression in adipose tissue in rats with dihydrotestosterone-induced polycystic ovary syndrome. Endocrinology 2008;149:3559–68.

- 49 Fei Wang, Tian de R, Tso P, et al. Arcuate nucleus of hypothalamus is involved in mediating the satiety effect of electroacupuncture in obese rats. Peptides 2011;32:2394–9.
- 50 Gong M, Wang X, Mao Z, et al. Effect of electroacupuncture on leptin resistance in rats with diet-induced obesity. Am J Chin Med 2012;40:511–20.
- 51 Liang F, Chen R, Nakagawa A, et al. Low-frequency electroacupuncture improves insulin sensitivity in obese diabetic mice through activation of SIRT1/PGC-1α in skeletal muscle. Evid Based Complement Alternat Med 2011;2011:735297.
- 52 Johansson J, Feng Y, Shao R, et al. Intense electroacupuncture normalizes insulin sensitivity, increases muscle GLUT4 content, and improves lipid profile in a rat model of polycystic ovary syndrome. Am J Physiol Endocrinol Metab 2010;299:E551–9.
- 53 Shapira MY, Appelbaum EY, Hirshberg B, et al. A sustained, non-insulin related, hypoglycaemic effect of electroacupuncture in diabetic Psammomys obesus. *Diabetologia* 2000;43:809–13.
- 54 Chang SL, Lin JG, Chi TC, et al. An insulin-dependent hypoglycaemia induced by electroacupuncture at the Zhongwan (CV12) acupoint in diabetic rats. *Diabetologia* 1999;42:250–5.
- 55 Ishizaki N, Okushi N, Yano T, et al. Improvement in glucose tolerance as a result of enhanced insulin sensitivity during electroacupuncture in spontaneously diabetic Goto-Kakizaki rats. Metabolism 2009;58:1372–8.
- 56 Chang SL, Tsai CC, Lin JG, et al. Involvement of serotonin in the hypoglycemic response to 2 Hz electroacupuncture of Zusanli acupoint (ST36) in rats. Neurosci Lett 2005;379:69–73.
- 57 Lin JG, Chen WC, Hsieh CL, et al. Multiple sources of endogenous opioid peptide involved in the hypoglycemic response to 15 Hz electroacupuncture at the Zhongwan acupoint in rats. Neurosci Lett 2004;366:39–42.
- 58 Lin RT, Tzeng CY, Lee YC, et al. Acute effect of electroacupuncture at the Zusanli acupoints on decreasing insulin resistance as shown by lowering plasma free fatty acid levels in steroid-background male rats. BMC Complement Altern Med 2009;9:26.
- 59 Higashimura Y, Shimoju R, Maruyama H, et al. Electro-acupuncture improves responsiveness to insulin via excitation of somatic afferent fibers in diabetic rats. Auton Neurosci 2009;150:100–3.
- 60 Chang SL, Lin KJ, Lin RT, et al. Enhanced insulin sensitivity using electroacupuncture on bilateral Zusanli acupoints (ST 36) in rats. Life Sci 2006:79:967–71.
- 61 Li M, Zhang Y. Modulation of gene expression in cholesterol-lowering effect of electroacupuncture at Fenglong acupoint (ST40): a cDNA microarray study. *Int J Mol Med* 2007;19:617–29.
- 62 Li X, Zhang Y, Yan W, et al. Isolation of genes involved in the preventive effect of electroacupuncture at Fenglong acupoint (ST40) on hypercholesterolemia mice by suppression subtractive hybridization (SSH) combined with negative subtraction chain (NSC) technology. Acupunct Electrother Res 2006;31:233–46.
- 63 Kang Y, Li M, Yan W, et al. Electroacupuncture alters the expression of genes associated with lipid metabolism and immune reaction in liver of hypercholesterolemia mice. Biotechnol Lett 2007;29:1817–24.
- 64 Lacey JM, Tershakovec AM, Foster GD. Acupuncture for the treatment of obesity: a review of the evidence. *Int J Obes Relat Metab Disord* 2003;27:419–27.

- 65 Sui Y, Zhao HL, Wong VC, et al. A systematic review on use of Chinese medicine and acupuncture for treatment of obesity. Obes Rev 2012;13:409–30.
- 66 Sun Q, Xu Y. Simple obesity and obesity hyperlipemia treated with otoacupoint pellet pressure and body acupuncture. *J Tradit Chin Med* 1993;13:22–6.
- 67 Mazzoni R, Mannucci E, Rizzello SM, et al. Failure of acupuncture in the treatment of obesity: a pilot study. Eat Weight Disord 1999;4:198–202.
- 68 Wang H. Observation on the therapeutic effects of acupuncture for 60 cases of simple obesity. J Tradit Chin Med 2002;22:187–9.
- 69 Woźniak P, Oszukowski P, Stachowiak G, et al. The effectiveness of low-calorie diet or diet with acupuncture treatment in obese peri- and postmenopausal women. Ginekol Pol 2003;74:102–7.
- 70 Nourshahi M, Ahmadizad S, Nikbakht H, et al. The effects of triple therapy (acupuncture, diet and exercise) on body weight: a randomized, clinical trial. Ernst E Int J Obes (Lond) 2009;33:583–7.
- 71 Yang JJ, Xing HJ, Xiao HL, et al. Effects of acupuncture combined with diet adjustment and aerobic exercise on weight and waist-hip ratio in simple obesity patients. Zhongguo Zhen Jiu 2010;30:555–8.
- 72 Güçel F, Bahar B, Demirtas C, et al. Influence of acupuncture on leptin, ghrelin, insulin and cholecystokinin in obese women: a randomised, sham-controlled preliminary trial. Acupunct Med 2012 Jun 22 (Epub ahead of print).
- 73 Shiraishi T, Onoe M, Kojima T, et al. Effects of bilateral auricular acupuncture stimulation on body weight in healthy volunteers and mildly obese patients. Exp Biol Med (Maywood) 2003;228:1201–7.
- 74 Hsu CH, Wang CJ, Hwang KC, et al. The effect of auricular acupuncture in obese women: a randomized controlled trial. J Womens Health 2009;18:813–8.
- 75 Shen EY, Hsieh CL, Chang YH, et al. Observation of sympathomimetic effect of ear acupuncture stimulation for body weight reduction. Am J Chin Med 2009;37:1023–30.
- 76 Cabioğlu MT, Ergene N. Electroacupuncture therapy for weight loss reduces serum total cholesterol, triglycerides, and LDL cholesterol levels in obese women. Am J Chin Med 2005;33:525–33.
- 77 Hsu CH, Hwang KC, Chao CL, *et al*. Effects of electroacupuncture in reducing weight and waist circumference in obese women: a randomized crossover trial. *Int J Obes* (*Lond*) 2005;29:1379–84.
- 78 Hsu CH, Hwang KC, Chao CL, et al. Electroacupuncture in obese women: a randomized, controlled pilot study. J Womens Health 2005;14:434–40.
- 79 Cabioğlu MT, Ergene N. Changes in serum leptin and beta endorphin levels with weight loss by electroacupuncture and diet restriction in obesity treatment. Am J Chin Med 2006;34:1–11.
- 80 Cabioğlu MT, Ergene N. Changes in levels of serum insulin, C-Peptide and glucose after electroacupuncture and diet therapy in obese women. Am J Chin Med 2006;34:367–76.
- 81 Cabioglu MT, Ergene N, Tan U. Electroacupuncture treatment of obesity with psychological symptoms. *Int J Neurosci* 2007;117:579–90.
- 82 Cabioglu MT, Ergene N, Surucu HS, *et al*. Serum IgG, IgA, IgM, and IgE levels after electroacupuncture and diet therapy in obese women. *Am J Chin Med* 2007;35: 955–65.

- 83 Luo HL, Li RH. Effect of electroacupuncture on leptin and adiponectin in simple obesity patients. *Zhen Ci Yan Jiu* 2007;32:264–7.
- 84 Cabioglu MT, Gundogan N, Ergene N. the efficacy of electroacupuncture therapy for weight loss changes plasma lipoprotein A, apolipoprotein A and apolipoprotein B
- levels in obese women. *Am J Chin Med* 2008;236: 1029–39.
- 85 Abdi H, Zhao B, Darbandi M, *et al*. The effects of body acupuncture on obesity: anthropometric parameters, lipid profile, and inflammatory and immunologic markers. *ScientificWorldJournal* 2012;2012:603539.



Acupuncture in the treatment of obesity: a narrative review of the literature

Maria Belivani, Charikleia Dimitroula, Niki Katsiki, et al.

Acupunct Med 2013 31: 88-97 originally published online November 15, 2012

doi: 10.1136/acupmed-2012-010247

Updated information and services can be found at:

http://aim.bmj.com/content/31/1/88.full.html

These include:

Data Supplement "Supplementary Data"

http://aim.bmj.com/content/suppl/2012/11/15/acupmed-2012-010247.DC1.html

References This article cites 82 articles, 4 of which can be accessed free at:

http://aim.bmj.com/content/31/1/88.full.html#ref-list-1

Article cited in:

http://aim.bmj.com/content/31/1/88.full.html#related-urls

Email alerting service

Receive free email alerts when new articles cite this article. Sign up in the box at the top right corner of the online article.

Notes

To request permissions go to: http://group.bmj.com/group/rights-licensing/permissions

To order reprints go to: http://journals.bmj.com/cgi/reprintform

To subscribe to BMJ go to: http://group.bmj.com/subscribe/